



## Supplementary Human Dimension Meeting

# ON ADDRESSING ALL FORMS OF INTOLERANCE AND DISCRIMINATION

25–26 May 2020  
(online)

# FINAL REPORT



## TABLE OF CONTENTS

|     |  |    |
|-----|--|----|
| I.  | EXECUTIVE SUMMARY .....  | 3  |
| II. | SYNOPSIS OF THE SESSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS .....   | 3  |
|     | OPENING SESSION .....  | 4  |
|     | SESSION I: Challenges to Realizing Tolerance and Non-Discrimination and the Impact of Compound Crises .....                                  | 6  |
|     | SESSION II: Addressing Contemporary Forms of Online Intolerance and Discrimination, Which Can Lead to Acts of Violence and Hate Crimes ..... | 10 |
|     | SESSION III: From Early Warning to Early Action: Prevention of Discrimination from Escalation into Tensions or Conflict .....                | 13 |
|     | CLOSING SESSION.....   | 15 |
|     | ANNEX 1: AGENDA .....  | 17 |
|     | ANNEX 2: BIOGRAPHICAL INFORMATION: Keynote Speaker, Introducers and Moderators.....  | 19 |

## **I. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY**

The Supplementary Human Dimension Meeting (SHDM) on “Addressing All Forms of Intolerance and Discrimination” was held online on 25–26 May 2020. It was organized by the Albanian OSCE Chair-in-Office (CiO), with the support of the OSCE Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights (ODIHR). The current Covid-19 pandemic has led to tragic loss of life and had a deep impact on economic security, with a risk of a further recession phase for the global economy. It has also led to violations of human rights: incidents of racist scapegoating in some countries, a dire situation for many migrants, worsening situation for Roma and Sinti, and the increase of domestic violence, further complicating the task of addressing intolerance and discrimination. It has fueled the proliferation of various forms of online intolerance and discrimination, which can lead to acts of violence and hate crimes. The pandemic has also highlighted the need for timely action to prevent interethnic tension and conflict, especially in the time of crises.

The SHDM provided an opportunity to review and assess challenges currently facing participating States in the implementation of OSCE commitments on addressing all forms of intolerance and discrimination, during compound crises and in online fora, in order to prevent discrimination from escalating into tensions or conflict. It also served as a platform for the exchange of good practice in addressing all forms of intolerance and discrimination particularly during crisis situations and in online discourse, and the sharing of recommendations to the OSCE participating States in addressing all forms of intolerance and discrimination, including the possible roles for the OSCE institutions to support them in this process.

The meeting brought together 231 registered participants (100 men, 130 women, 1 not defined), including 111 representatives from 52 participating States, 43 participants from OSCE institutions, executive structures, and missions/field operations, 5 representatives of 3 international organizations, 2 representatives of national human rights institutions, and 70 participants representing civil society and other organizations. An unspecified number of viewers also watched the live broadcast of the SHDM on the OSCE’s YouTube channel.

## **II. SYNOPSIS OF THE SESSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS**

This section summarizes the discussions which took place during the opening session, the three thematic sessions, and presents recommendations made by participants. The recommendations were directed towards a variety of actors, including OSCE participating States, OSCE institutions and field operations, and civil society organizations. These recommendations have no official status as they are not based on consensus among the 57 OSCE participating States. Further, the inclusion of a recommendation in this report does not suggest that it reflects the views or policies of the OSCE. Nevertheless, these recommendations serve as useful reflections of how participating States are meeting their commitments to combat intolerance and discrimination, including on religious grounds as well as promoting mutual respect and understanding.

## OPENING SESSION

*Opening remarks:*

**Ambassador Igli Hasani**, Chairperson of the OSCE Permanent Council

**Ms. Ingibjörg Sólrún Gísladóttir**, Director, OSCE ODIHR

Summary of opening remarks:

**Ambassador Igli Hasani** opened the SHDM noting that the promotion of tolerance and non-discrimination is one of the key priorities of the Albanian CiO, and that the first CiO event in 2020, the Tirana Conference on Combating Anti-Semitism in the OSCE Region, was devoted to issues of tolerance and non-discrimination. He noted that 30 years have passed since the seminal Copenhagen Document and the landmark Charter of Paris, where the participating States recognized that commitments undertaken in the field of the human dimension are matters of direct and legitimate concern to all participating States and do not belong exclusively to the internal affairs of the State concerned (Moscow 1991), and firmly placed the human dimension at the core of the OSCE's comprehensive concept of security (Istanbul 1999). In short, concerns related to tolerance and non-discrimination are of legitimate concern for all, and at the core of a security organization such as the OSCE. The OSCE has comprehensive commitments to counter all forms of intolerance and discrimination, as well as the tools, expertise, support and assistance ODIHR can provide. The organization is therefore well-placed to address the implementation of our commitments on tolerance and non-discrimination also in the context of the ongoing Covid-19 pandemic.

According to Ambassador Hasani, the Covid-19 pandemic has not only demonstrated gaps in the implementation of existing commitments, but also compounded efforts to address inequality, intolerance and discrimination. He shared that this was the first OSCE human dimension meeting held online, and the first OSCE meeting hosted in the OSCE headquarters in the Hofburg since the pandemic started. Ambassador Hasani also welcomed the participation of all three Personal Representatives of the Chairperson-in-Office on Tolerance and Non-Discrimination Issues: Rabbi Andrew Baker, Ambassador Mehmet Paçacı and Dr. Regina Polak, from Washington, DC, Ankara and Vienna respectively. He concluded by sharing that promoting tolerance and non-discrimination not only starts at home, but that international tolerance and non-discrimination challenges in the OSCE region can also be effectively addressed from home.

In her opening remarks, Ms. **Ingibjörg Sólrún Gísladóttir** shared that the aim of the SHDM was to provide an opportunity for the OSCE participating States, institutions and executive structures, as well as international organizations, civil society representatives, and other stakeholders, to take stock of the OSCE human dimension commitments in the sphere of addressing all forms of intolerance and discrimination. This process needs to clarify and explore the multi-faceted dimensions of addressing intolerance and discrimination at the time of a major global public health emergency. Across the OSCE area, the current Covid-19 pandemic has added new layers of complexity to an already difficult task of addressing

manifestations of intolerance and discrimination, such as hate crime. Reports of intolerance, discrimination and hate-motivated attacks across the OSCE region against people of Asian backgrounds, migrants, Roma and Sinti, and people from other minority communities have proliferated. The pandemic has fuelled the increase of various forms of online intolerance and discrimination, which can lead to acts of violence and hate crimes.

In times of multiple or compound crises, the threat posed by intolerance and discrimination only intensifies, heightening the sense of fear and uncertainty, according to Ms. Gísladóttir. The SHDM would provide a valuable opportunity for all participating States to remind themselves of the OSCE commitments on tolerance and non-discrimination, as well as to think about ways to meaningfully respect and translate these commitments into action. All efforts still must be focused on reporting and recording hate crimes, as well as on their proper investigation and prosecution. She issued a reminder that all must work hard to ensure that our societies do not become indifferent to intolerance and discrimination. Ms. Gísladóttir concluded by encouraging participants to share good practices and lessons learnt in this regard, and to provide concrete recommendations to participating States, which all could learn from, and hopefully emulate, at this very important and challenging moment.

*Keynote speech:*

**Prof. Fernand de Varennnes**, UN Special Rapporteur on minority issues

Summary of the keynote speech:

**Prof. de Varennnes** located the human dimension at the core of the current Covid-19 crisis because it was not only a health issue: it has evolved and merged with other factors into an economic issue, a reflection of inequality and exclusion, the growing propagation of the viruses of hate, fear and intolerance alongside the corona virus itself, and even a menace to the multilateralism upon which the world's human rights architecture is based and depends. He noted that, in his work as the UN Special Rapporteur on minority issues, the current situation has manifested itself with the rise of hate speech, physical attacks, scapegoating and demonizing of particular minorities. It also created fertile ground for extremists and racists to fuel xenophobia, intolerance and discrimination against those who are considered "other."

The Covid-19-related crisis has served as a magnifying glass of tensions already existing around social and economic inequalities, intolerance, and discrimination, and amplified these, according to Prof. de Varennnes. Extremists have used this as an opportunity to instrumentalize fear and insecurity, providing simplistic solutions to complex problems. There has also been an instrumentalization of the crisis as an occasion to present or treat minorities as security threats, and as an opportunity to adopt restrictive legislative and other controls dismissive of fundamental human rights standards. Where reliable disaggregated data is available, two striking results quickly become visible: first, some minorities were clearly disproportionately affected by or were more likely to die from the virus. This is often linked to socio-economic inequalities, to precarious employment and the ensuing social and physical environment. Secondly, where data is available, it was also obvious that there has been a significant increase in hate speech and crimes against some, quite often though not always the same, minorities.

Prof. de Varennes highlighted that one lesson this pandemic has perhaps taught us was the importance of data, of testing and identifying to understand the nature and extent of the crisis in order to be able to take effective measures to combat and eventually control it. As a longer-term challenge, he mentioned the re-appearance and growth of nation-first politics and the weakening of multilateralism. He also noted that intolerance and discrimination against minorities were on the rise with denials of their right to equal access to health care and information; crackdowns against minority and human rights activists were also increasing, and there was even adoption of legislation during the pandemic that would allow the disenfranchisement of millions of individuals and block the operation of organizations protecting their rights or of assembly and expression. Prof. de Varennes noted that many positive developments in countering intolerance and discrimination have taken place throughout the OSCE area, but despite progress, it seemed that intolerance and discrimination continue to grow. He concluded with noting that the pandemic has evidently added complexities, but also created an opportunity for new, tailored and improved approaches to addressing all forms of intolerance and discrimination, especially in the case of those who are usually and disproportionately the most targeted and vulnerable: minorities and migrants.

## **SESSION I: Challenges to Realizing Tolerance and Non-Discrimination and the Impact of Compound Crises**

### *Introducers:*

**Ms. Maria Marouda**, Chair, European Commission against Racism and Intolerance (ECRI)

**Dr. Regina Polak**, Personal Representative of the OSCE Chairperson-in-Office on Combating Racism, Xenophobia and Discrimination, also focusing on Intolerance and Discrimination against Christians and Members of Other Religions

### *Moderator:*

Ms. Christie Edwards, Acting Head, Tolerance and Non-Discrimination Department, OSCE ODIHR

### Summary of introducers' interventions:

Ms. **Maria Marouda** opened her presentation by presenting the statement made by ECRI's Bureau in conclusion of its meeting of 19 May 2020, paying attention to three groups of concern to ECRI who have been particularly affected, either due to extensive restrictions or due to their inherent vulnerability: Roma, migrants, as well as LGBTI persons. The ECRI Bureau observed that these hardships are deepening with the Covid-19 pandemic and the exclusion of the most vulnerable people will further intensify if governments do not take action to meet their specific needs and counter anti-Roma and anti-migrant hate speech and violence as a matter of urgency. In this context, ECRI's Bureau called on states to take due account of ECRI's general policy recommendations, and to co-operate with equality bodies and civil society organizations when developing, implementing and evaluating their responses to the Covid-19 pandemic. ECRI already raised alarm about worrying trends shortly before the Covid-19 outbreak: that xenophobic nationalism and racist hatred in Europe continued to

undermine the action taken or planned by governments and other partners to make equality for all a reality, to present diversity as a major strength and to develop more inclusive societies. In a number of countries, these trends were further inflamed by politicians, or public figures in general, who wished to stir resentment against specific groups. Ms. Marouda presented a number of promising practices from the Council of Europe participating States. She recommended that specific groups that have been particularly affected by the Covid-19 and potential other crises, generally the most marginalized groups such as Roma and migrants, should be at the centre of attention during crises. Close attention should also be paid to groups which are often specific targets of racism, discrimination and intolerance in ordinary times: Muslims, Jewish people and people of African descent. Ms. Marouda concluded that governments should adopt a clear human rights-based approach at all times and even more so in times of crisis, and recommended that Covid-19 task forces or advisory boards set up by governments must include specialists in human rights, particularly from the fields of equality and non-discrimination.

**Dr. Regina Polak** expressed her concerns that the Covid-19-related crisis dramatically increased the manifestations and impact of intolerance, discrimination, xenophobia, and racism in our societies, and stressed the urgent necessity to develop positive narratives and visions for a common future in peace. She reminded the participants that, in the last decades, the OSCE participating States have established a normative framework of Ministerial Council Decisions to address and combat these phenomena, and that now is the time when these commitments can make a difference. To effectively combat intolerance, discrimination, and racism, we need to understand that these are not just psychological or morally reprehensible misconceptions, but that the rejection, exclusion and hatred of minorities reflect internal economic and social difficulties in the respective political systems. Dr. Polak also spoke about the manifestations of hate speech on the internet, and noted that public officials must renounce and ensure robust interventions on these phenomena while committing to freedom of expression. She called for creating new and positive narratives of a pluralistic society. Therefore, in these difficult times forces must be joined, and what is needed is strong legislation, committed public institutions and organizations, high-quality media, creative action in public space for dialogue and encounter, and inclusive education for both young people and adults. Civil society plays a crucial role in the enterprise of creating an inclusive coexistence, a co-operative conviviality, and participating States should encourage civil society's activities through effective partnerships. Dr. Polak concluded that we also must promote solidarity and co-operate courageously at all levels of society, nationally and internationally.

In the discussion that followed, participants expressed concern about whole communities being threatened by intolerance and discrimination, which is additionally multiplied by the Covid-19 crisis. Intolerance and discrimination may affect both majority and minority communities, and all cases should be given equal attention. Addressing tolerance cannot be used in a way to restrict fundamental freedoms. Some participants raised the issues of human rights violations against certain minority groups in particular States. A representative of an intergovernmental organizations stated that racial discrimination and intolerance are forces of forced displacement, and can undermine protection for refugees, internally displaced persons and asylum seekers. A number of participants spoke about the important role of ODIHR in addressing intolerance and discrimination in the OSCE region.

Participants made the following specific recommendations in Session I:

*Recommendations to the OSCE participating States:*

- To revisit and update OSCE's tolerance and non-discrimination commitments;
- To investigate the February 2020 Kordai conflict in Kazakhstan;
- To address the issue of ethnic discrimination in OSCE participating States with international legal mechanisms;
- For the CiO, to facilitate a discussion on challenges to realizing tolerance and non-discrimination and the impact of compound crises before the Ministerial Council;
- To respect cultural diversity;
- To respect the rights of minorities to use their languages in education, especially during crises;
- To use lessons learnt from this crisis for future Roma strategies post-2020;
- To refrain from co-operating with groups that promote human rights violations and commit anti-Roma attacks;
- To develop social protection plans for Roma;
- To include refugees and stateless persons into health care systems;
- To welcome initiatives by civil society in solidarity actions for refugees and migrants;
- To collect disaggregated data relating to intolerance and discrimination;
- To do more to address anti-Semitism, in collaboration with Jewish communities;
- To monitor, document and respond to hate crime, as committed in Ministerial Council Decision 9/09;
- To report hate crime statistics to ODIHR;
- To organize a training on the definition of anti-Semitism by the International Holocaust Remembrance Alliance (IHRA) for all public officials;
- To ensure access to education for Roma children, online or differently in participating States;
- To ensure access to education for young Roma mothers in participating States;
- To allow civil society access and monitoring to all government facilities and detention centres for migrants in Europe;
- To look into the Basel Declaration of the Civic Solidarity Platform and its recommendations;
- For Latvia, Lithuania and Estonia, to bring language and education legislation in line with international and regional practice; sign the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages; and ensure the protection of activists and journalists;
- To pay attention to the discrimination of religious rights and phobia against religion;
- To promptly identify perpetrators of incidents of xenophobic graffiti and damage, and to take measures to prevent such intolerance and discrimination;
- To respect the mother tongues of minorities;
- To stop the persecution of Jehovah's Witnesses in certain OSCE participating States;
- For participating States to bring to justice those responsible for human rights violations against LGBTI persons;



- For the Russian Federation to implement the recommendations of the OSCE Moscow Mechanism rapporteur on alleged human rights violations and impunity in the Chechen Republic of the Russian Federation, and to co-operate with OSCE participating States and institutions on this issue;
- To leave no one behind in the COVID-19 crisis, and take care of those who are subject to vulnerability and discriminated, especially those affected by multiple and intersectional forms of discrimination;
- To step up efforts to report hate crime to ODIHR;
- To implement commitments to combat all forms of intolerance and discrimination, taking a comprehensive approach, while still taking into account specificities of particular groups;
- To work with civil society on collecting data on intolerance and discrimination.

*Recommendations to the OSCE institutions and field operations:*

- To organize an event to discuss the rights of minorities to use their languages;
- For OSCE leaders, to express concern about threats to tolerance caused by hate speech and hate crime;
- For ODIHR, to continue the Words into Action project;
- To organize a training on the definition of anti-Semitism by the International Holocaust Remembrance Alliance (IHRA) for all OSCE staff;
- To support participating States in fighting discrimination;
- To further efforts such as the ODIHR project Building a Comprehensive Criminal Justice Response to Hate Crime, or the Words into Action project, and make them applicable for the current crisis, by recording and monitoring actions by different States;
- For ODIHR and the OSCE Special Monitoring Mission to Ukraine (SMM), to monitor the situation in territories not controlled by the Ukrainian government;
- To pay special attention to language and education laws in Latvia, Lithuania and Estonia;
- To pay attention to the situation of activists and journalists in Latvia, Lithuania and Estonia.
- To strengthen co-operation between ODIHR, ECRI and the European Union Fundamental Rights Agency (FRA).

*Recommendations to civil society, international organizations and other actors:*

- For the CoE, to pay special attention to the language and education laws in Latvia, Lithuania and Estonia;
- For the CoE, to pay attention to the situation of activists and journalists in Latvia, Lithuania and Estonia.

## **SESSION II: Addressing Contemporary Forms of Online Intolerance and Discrimination, Which Can Lead to Acts of Violence and Hate Crimes**

*Introducers:*

**Andrew Lane**, Director, Quaker Council for European Affairs

**Ms. Quinn McKew**, Acting Executive Director, Article 19

*Moderator:*

Mr. Tome Shekerdjiev, Acting Deputy Head, Tolerance and Non-Discrimination Department, OSCE ODIHR

Summary of introducers' interventions:

**Andrew Lane** discussed the issue of hate speech, emphasizing that hate speech runs counter to human dignity, and resilience to hate speech is needed across society. The internet allows messages to spread quickly to millions, and it only needs to be acted upon by a small minority to result in the personal suffering and community wounds that comes with hate crime. In 2019, the Quaker Council for European Affairs (QCEA) undertook a research study looking at hate speech in the website comment sections of major newspapers across the OSCE region. QCEA had been concerned that some newspapers appeared to be writing provocative articles that did not cross the line into hate speech, but their websites were filling up with hate speech in the space for public comments underneath each article. Lane mentioned some of the positive responses to online hate speech coming from citizens themselves. In conclusion, Lane identified the current political moment as a moment when we should build on our common humanity. The sense of compassion has been strengthened during the Covid-19 crisis. After the crisis, there will be a pressure on economic recovery, yet we will also need a social recovery process.

**Ms. Quinn McKew** spoke about hate speech and online harassment in the OSCE region. The pandemic has merely crystalized and magnified the bigotry, as the same groups seek to blame their usual targets for the spreading the coronavirus. Also, journalists, health professionals, aid workers, human rights defenders and others have been targeted simply for doing their jobs. With regards to hate speech in the context of Covid-19, according to civil society sources, an immediate reaction to the spread of the virus has been a rise in online prejudice and hate speech towards China and persons of Asian descent. International human rights standards allow States to restrict free expression and some other rights in order to protect public health during a time of public emergency, but only in very limited circumstances. Ms. McKew presented the conditions that any such criteria would have to meet: legality; necessity and proportionality; arbitrariness and non-discrimination; being subject to regular reviews, as well as time-limited. In conclusion, Ms. McKew emphasized that guarantees for the human rights to equality and to freedom of expression must be at the core of States' responses to hate speech. When these rights are protected for everyone, opportunities will be maximized for people to speak out against prejudice and discrimination and ensure accurate and positive coverage of marginalized groups in the media and public discourse more broadly.

In the discussion on the topic, representatives of participating States described their government's activities regarding the exercise of freedom of religion or belief during Covid-19 pandemic. Delegations stressed the importance of the technological aspects of addressing intolerance and discrimination online; working with authors of hate speech; the role of media; and the importance of OSCE commitments on tolerance and non-discrimination. Civil society representatives spoke about the work of organized hate groups in their environments, and the situation of minorities during Covid-19. Personal Representative of the OSCE Chairperson-in-Office on Combating Intolerance and Discrimination against Muslims, Ambassador Mehmet Paçacı, provided observations on the effects of the Covid-19 crisis on Muslim communities.

Various participants also mentioned and praised ODIHR's work on tolerance and non-discrimination, including its data collection on hate crimes, as well as its new publication *Understanding Anti-Muslim Hate Crimes – Addressing the Security Needs of Muslim Communities: A Practical Guide*, to which Muslim communities and civil society organizations contributed significantly.

Participants made the following specific recommendations in Session II:

*Recommendations to the OSCE participating States:*

- To engage with the most affected communities;
- To endorse commitments set forth by the OSCE Ministerial Council Decisions 10/05 and 13/06 in terms of raising public awareness and education about intolerance;
- In case freedom of expression limitations are adopted during a health emergency situation, concrete conditions must be fulfilled: legality; necessity and proportionality, including pursuing a legitimate aim; non-arbitrariness; regular review; and the measures must be time-limited;
- Online content should be protected and measures should not be applied in a discriminatory manner, since those affected by hate speech might have limited access to seek redress;
- Freedom of expression must be at the core of States' responses to hate speech, and equal opportunities should be provided for everyone to speak out against prejudice;
- To promote religious enlightenment, which is key to address extremism;
- Politicians should be role models for promoting tolerance;
- To work closely with civil society organizations and focus on solving problems together;
- Not to use the pandemic to suppress civil society organizations, or legitimate and peaceful political opposition;
- To facilitate a respectful dialogue and encourage an atmosphere of tolerance;
- To preserve fundamental rights, with a focus on areas inhabited by minorities;
- To avoid distinctive policies and actions, in particular regarding Muslim communities;
- To address intolerance through education and involving young people;
- To allocate resources to non-criminal means of countering hate speech.

*Recommendations to the OSCE institutions and field operations:*

- To monitor the situation of the Western Thrace Muslim community in Greece;
- To monitor national and religious minorities and how they are treated during the current Covid-19 crisis;
- The OSCE Representative on Freedom of the Media should develop guidelines on countering religious intolerance in the media.

*Recommendations to civil society, international organizations and other actors:*

- To take inspiration from the successful citizen movements, such as I Am Here Movement in Sweden, involving more than a hundred thousand supporters to come together on Facebook; the Council of Europe's No Hate Movement; Media against Hate; Mandela Project; Facing Facts; or the Prison Project;
- To work on counter-narratives, including sharing stories online;
- To adopt codes of ethics and professional standards for/by Internet Service Providers;
- Media should make sure to cover the most marginalized groups.

### **SESSION III: From Early Warning to Early Action: Prevention of Discrimination from Escalation into Tensions or Conflict**

#### *Introducers:*

**Ms. Montserrat Pina Martínez**, President, European Network of Policewomen

**Ms. Savita Pawnday**, Deputy Executive Director, Global Centre for the Responsibility to Protect

#### *Moderator:*

Mr. Christophe Kamp, Director, OSCE High Commissioner on National Minorities (HCNM)

#### Summary of introducers' interventions:

In her presentation, Ms. **Montserrat Pina Martínez** spoke about the impact of community policing on societal cohesion, and spoke about the motto of the European Network of Policewomen, "Quality through Equality." Through their work, it is clear that police must respect human rights, inside and outside the organization. She presented the various ways in which police work was affected by the Covid-19 pandemic. With regards to addressing hate crime, police must send a message back to the perpetrators to indicate that, in their community, this kind of behavior would not be tolerated. It is important to provide officers with skills and strategies to investigate and respond to hate crimes. Community police have emerged as a link between the individual and the authorities, and play a key role in building trust; thus, they need to pay particular attention to diversity. Ms. Martínez emphasized the need to safeguard human rights, freedom and respect, especially of minorities or vulnerable groups, including when this outbreak has hopefully passed. She expressed concerns that a major consequence of the Covid-19 pandemic would probably be greater socio-economic inequality, and greater efforts would be required to balance this inequality. She concluded by calling for a sustainable approach in addressing societal issues, and providing "quality through equality."

Ms. **Savita Pawnday** introduced the work of her organization, focusing on the implementation of the Responsibility to Protect, a global norm that was unanimously adopted by heads of states and governments at the 2005 UN World Summit, aimed at preventing and halting genocide, war crimes, crimes against humanity and ethnic cleansing. In many situations, marginalization, exclusion, hate speech and hate crimes are factors that are early indicators of atrocity risks, and these early warning signs have further been identified in a number of current and ongoing atrocity situations. In divided and fragile societies already suffering from identity-based conflict, Covid-19 has increased various risk factors that could lead to mass atrocity crimes. Xenophobic violence, stereotyping, stigmatization, discrimination and the use of derogatory, misogynistic, racist, xenophobic, anti-Muslim or anti-Semitic language were on the rise since the outbreak of the virus, according to Ms. Pawnday. Some governments and politicians took advantage of the pandemic to bolster their personal power or weaken human rights protections. In states which have experienced tensions and violence along ethnic and religious lines, reconciliation and societal change can only be achieved through judicial and social accountability mechanisms, such as prosecution of perpetrators or establishing truth and reconciliation mechanisms. In other contexts, a strong civil society and a pluralistic media are vital to counter right wing and xenophobic rhetoric.

While discrimination, marginalization and inflammatory rhetoric are processes that are built up and are often institutionalized over a longer period of time, the escalation into mass atrocities can happen swiftly. Ms. Pawnday concluded with a reminder that it is our individual and shared responsibility to therefore recognize these patterns as early warning signs and react swiftly and decisively to protect populations from atrocities.

In the discussion following the introducers' presentations, a number of civil society representatives raised concerns about the intolerance and discrimination against certain minority groups in particular OSCE participating States. It was stressed that education is a good tool for addressing intolerance and discrimination. Concerns were expressed about participating States using the pandemic crisis to derogate and violate human rights. A representative of an intergovernmental organization highlighted the importance of the collection of disaggregated data on hate crimes, and victims of hate-motivated crimes. A number of participants also mentioned ODIHR and its relevant tools and expertise, such as ODIHR's trainings on addressing hate crime, and the Training against Hate Crimes for Law Enforcement (TAHCLE) programme.

Participants made the following specific recommendations in Session III:

*Recommendations to the OSCE participating States:*

- Official statement by participating States with regards to Covid-19 accusations directed to other States should be based on proven facts;
- To strengthen inter-religious and inter-faith dialogues;
- To protect national minorities, and to implement and respect laws related to national minorities;
- To provide financial assistance to fight intolerance and discrimination;
- To draw all resources to the OSCE and other agencies to fight against intolerance and discrimination;
- To tackle intolerance and discrimination towards nomadic and Roma communities, and for the participating States to recognize and value nomadic way of life and values;
- To contribute to positive process in societies and to prohibit discrimination on religious ground;
- To acknowledge the important role that education systems have in addressing stereotypes and prejudices which lead to intolerance and discrimination.

*Recommendations to the OSCE institutions and field operations:*

- National inclusion strategies for national minorities to engage in process of inclusion in crisis and post-crisis for national minorities in countries, while taking into account gender, age, disability and other protected characteristics;
- To condemn illegal acts of vandalism directed towards the destruction of historical and religious monuments;
- To condemn occurrences of intolerance and discrimination.

*Recommendations to civil society, international organizations and other actors:*

- To monitor incidents of hate speech in the media used by States and public figures;
- To use the European Court for Human Rights as an important tool in tackling and addressing occurrences of intolerance and discrimination;
- To include atrocity prevention specialists in dealing with online occurrences of hate crimes.

## **CLOSING SESSION**

*Closing remarks:*

**Ms. Katarzyna Gardapkhadze**, First Deputy Director, OSCE ODIHR

**Ms. Erida Dobrush**i, Minister Plenipotentiary, Deputy Permanent Representative, 2020 Albanian Chairmanship

Summary of closing remarks:

In her closing remarks, Ms. **Katarzyna Gardapkhadze** noted that Covid-19 virus struck at a moment when societies in the OSCE region were already more polarized than they have been in decades. She noted that the fact that the pandemic has had disproportional health, mortality, economic and other impacts on minority and vulnerable groups is not because these groups are somehow naturally weaker, but because their resilience has been taken away. Her second observation was that discrimination and intolerance do not exist in a vacuum, and that the pandemic has made it all the more obvious how interconnected the existing social, technological, political, and economic variables are. The debate about the global distribution of the Covid-19 vaccine, seemingly unrelated to human rights issues, would profoundly affect equality and social cohesion. Ms. Gardapkhadze also noted that the lack of preparedness for this pandemic has demonstrated the lack of solidarity in our social and political life, and that the only way to rebuild into stronger, more cohesive societies is through compassion and solidarity. She concluded by highlighting that we now have a unique opportunity to rethink our values and intentions, and to build the just, compassionate and sustainable world we all need to survive.

On behalf of the 2020 Albanian CiO, Ms. **Erida Dobrush**i also noted how Roma and Sinti, migrants, refugees, LGBTI, religious and national minorities, and other targeted and vulnerable individuals and communities have all reported concerning bias-motivated rhetoric, incidents and attacks in the wake of the Covid-19 pandemic. She believed this SHDM therefore was timely and topical in reaffirming OSCE commitments and recalling the tools, expertise, support and assistance at disposal in the OSCE, its institutions and executive structures, in building and strengthening collective, comprehensive security. Ms. Dobrush found it encouraging to hear about good practices applied by participating States, local governments and civil society organizations. This provided inspiration for collective, comprehensive responses to the ongoing challenges, support and assistance for those most

affected or at risk. It provided hope for better solutions also for our post-pandemic times. The first human dimension meeting conducted online also showed how new technologies can bring people from all parts of the vast OSCE region closer together. Ms. Dobrushina concluded with emphasizing some of the greatest added values of the OSCE: serving as a platform for dialogue for and among States, but also with civil society, and thanked all participants for their engagement and contribution.



## ANNEX 1: AGENDA



### Supplementary Human Dimension Meeting

### on Addressing All Forms of Intolerance and Discrimination

25–26 May 2020  
(online)

### AGENDA

#### Day 1      25 May

15.00 – 16.00

#### OPENING SESSION

*Opening remarks:*

- **Amb. Igli Hasani**, Chairperson of the OSCE Permanent Council
- **Ms. Ingibjörg Sólrún Gísladóttir**, Director, OSCE ODIHR

*Keynote speech:* **Prof. Fernand de Vareennes**, UN Special Rapporteur on Minority Issues

*Technical information:* Ms. Katarzyna Gardapkhadze, First Deputy Director, OSCE ODIHR

16.00 – 18.00

#### SESSION I: Challenges to Realizing Tolerance and Non-Discrimination and the Impact of Compound Crises

*Introducers:*

- **Ms. Maria Marouda**, Chair, ECRI
- **Dr. Regina Polak**, Personal Representative of the OSCE Chairperson-in-Office on Combating Racism, Xenophobia and Discrimination, also focusing on Intolerance and Discrimination against Christians and Members of Other Religions

*Moderator:* Ms. Christie Edwards, Acting Head, Tolerance and Non-Discrimination Department, OSCE ODIHR

**Day 2**                      **26 May**

10.30 – 12.30                      **SESSION II: Addressing Contemporary Forms of Online Intolerance and Discrimination, Which Can Lead to Acts of Violence and Hate Crimes**

*Introducers:*

- **Andrew Lane**, Director, Quaker Council for European Affairs
- **Ms. Quinn McKew**, Acting Executive Director, Article 19

*Moderator:* Mr. Tome Shekerdjiev, Acting Deputy Head, Tolerance and Non-Discrimination Department, OSCE ODIHR

14.30 – 16.30                      **SESSION III: From Early Warning to Early Action: Prevention of Discrimination from Escalation into Tensions or Conflict**

*Introducers:*

- **Ms. Montserrat Pina Martínez**, President, European Network of Policewomen
- **Ms. Savita Pawnday**, Deputy Executive Director, Global Centre for the Responsibility to Protect

*Moderator:* Mr. Christophe Kamp, Director, HCNM

16.30 – 17.30                      **CLOSING SESSION**

*Rapports from the working sessions*

*Comments from the floor*

*Closing remarks:*

- **Ms. Katarzyna Gardapkhadze**, First Deputy Director, OSCE ODIHR
- **Ms. Erida Dobrush**i, Minister Plenipotentiary, Deputy Permanent Representative, 2020 Albanian Chairmanship

17.30                                      Closing of the meeting

\* \* \* \* \*

## **ANNEX 2: BIOGRAPHICAL INFORMATION: Keynote Speaker, Introducers and Moderators**

### *Opening remarks:*

**Ambassador Igli Hasani**, Chairperson of the OSCE Permanent Council

Ambassador Igli Hasani was appointed Permanent Representative of the Republic of Albania to the OSCE and other International Organizations in Vienna in February 2018. He has extensive experience in international security and has contributed to the shaping of the security and defence policy package of the Republic of Albania. He has 17 years of experience at the Albanian Ministry of Defence in various management roles, including as Secretary General (2017 -2018), Director General for Defence Policy (2015-2017), Director of NATO and Foreign Relations (2013-2014), Director of Euro-Atlantic Integration (2013-2014) as well director of Press and Information, Policy and Media and Legal Affairs. Prior to his career at the Ministry of Defence, he worked as journalist and editor for several newspapers and TV stations in Albania. Ambassador Hasani holds degrees in Law, Sociology and Philosophy from the University of Tirana, a Master in International Relations from King's College, London and is a graduate of the Royal College of Defence Studies.

**Ms. Ingibjörg Sólrún Gísladóttir**, Director, OSCE ODIHR

Ingibjörg Sólrún Gísladóttir was Director of the OSCE Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights from 18 July 2017 to 18 July 2020. Ms. Gísladóttir has 35 years of leadership experience working on human rights, democratic governance and the rule of law at the international, national and local levels. Before taking up the position of ODIHR Director, she served from 2014 as Regional Director for Europe and Central Asia and Country Representative to Turkey for UN Women. From 2011 to 2014 she was Country Representative of UN Women to Afghanistan. From 2007 to 2009, Ms. Gísladóttir served as Minister for Foreign Affairs of Iceland. She was previously a Member of Parliament and Chairperson and Leader of the Social Democratic Alliance (2005–2009) and Mayor of the City of Reykjavik (1994–2003). Throughout her career, she has been involved in policy and development work in conflict and non-conflict countries, aimed at strengthening democratic institutions and human rights. In the early years of her political career, in 1982, Ms. Gísladóttir was one of the founders of the Women's Party, laying the ground for Iceland's remarkable progress in gender equality. She holds a Bachelor's degree in history and literature from the University of Iceland (1979), and pursued post-graduate studies in history at the University of Copenhagen (1979–1981). In 2004, Ms. Gísladóttir was a Visiting Scholar at the European Institute, London School of Economics (LSE). She speaks English, French and Danish.

### *Keynote Speech:*

**Prof. Fernand de Varennes**, UN Special Rapporteur on Minority Issues

Dr. Fernand de Varennes was elected in 2017 by the UN Human Rights Council as Special Rapporteur on Minority Issues. He is also Extraordinary Professor at the Faculty of Law of the University of Pretoria (South Africa), Adjunct Professor at the National University of Ireland-Galway (Ireland), and Cheng Yu Tung Visiting Professor at the Faculty of Law of the University of Hong Kong (China). He is renowned as one of the world's leading experts on the

international human rights of minorities and has worked in areas of international law such as the prevention of ethnic conflicts, the rights of migrants, and the relationship between ethnicity, human rights and democracy. He completed his law degrees in Canada (LLB, Moncton), the United Kingdom (LLM, London School of Economics and Political Science), and the Netherlands (Dr Juris, Maastricht). Dr. de Varennes' research and publications record spans over 200 publications in more than 30 languages. In recognition of his work and achievements in the field of human rights and the protection of minorities, he has received accolades from different parts of the world, including the 2004 Linguapax Award (Barcelona, Spain), the Knight's Cross of the Order of Merit of the Republic of Poland, and the Tip O'Neill Peace Fellowship (Northern Ireland, UK).

*Session I:*

**Ms. Maria Marouda**, Chair, ECRI

Chair of the European Committee against Racism and Intolerance (since January 2020, term of two years), independent member in respect of Greece. Assistant Professor in International Law, Panteion University of Athens and Jean Monnet Chair Holder on Civil Protection and Humanitarian Action (emphasis on migration and solidarity). Director of the European Training and Research Center on Human Rights and Humanitarian Action (EKEKDAAD) - Project Coordinator UNESCO Chair on Peace, Human Rights and Democracy - Head of EU and UNHCR Research projects on mapping integration indicators for the inclusion of refugee and migrant children through education, as well as on homeless unaccompanied children. Professor at the Hellenic National Defence School and Police School of National Security. Fifteen years of experience in humanitarian fieldwork, through OSCE, UNHCR and then International Committee of the Red Cross, in armed conflicts (1996 Bosnia Herzegovina, 1997 Albania, 1999 Kosovo, 1998–1999 Sri Lanka), and then onwards based in Greece with short missions in crises areas.

**Dr. Regina Polak**, Personal Representative of the OSCE Chairperson-in-Office on Combating Racism, Xenophobia and Discrimination, also focusing on Intolerance and Discrimination against Christians and Members of Other Religions

Regina Polak is the Head of the Institute for Practical Theology at the Catholic Theological Faculty of the University of Vienna. She is Assoc.-Prof. for Practical Theology. Her research focuses on religion in the context of migration and urbanization; religion and values; socio-religious transformation processes in Europe; Christian-Jewish and Christian-Islamic dialogue. She is a leading member of the Research Center "Religion and Transformation in Contemporary Society" at the University of Vienna. There she also leads the post-graduate course "Muslims in Europe". Currently she leads a project on the European Values Study reflecting the relationship between religious and political attitudes.

**Ms. Christie Edwards**, Acting Head, Tolerance and Non-Discrimination Department, OSCE ODIHR (moderator)

Christie Edwards is an internationally recognized and published legal expert with over twenty years of experience working on international humanitarian and human rights law, gender, international policy and advocacy, and international community development. Christie has led successful non-profit management and implementation programs, strategic planning, and grants management in senior leadership roles at national and international levels with prominent NGOs and international organizations. Currently, Christie serves as the Acting Head of the Tolerance and Non-Discrimination Department of the OSCE Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights, addressing issues of racism, xenophobia, discrimination, and hate crimes. Previously, as the Director of International Humanitarian Law at the American Red Cross, Christie led ARC's legal education, public, and youth outreach efforts on IHL, directly reaching over 60,000 people per year with a social reach of over 24 million. Christie has also worked at a torture treatment clinic for political refugees, served as counsel for asylum seekers, managed and implemented human rights, political advocacy, and civil society building programs in the MENA region following the Arab Spring. Finally, Christie serves as the Co-Chair of the International Organizations Interest Group of the American Society of International Law (ASIL), co-founded ASIL's Women's Mentoring Program for over 400 participants worldwide, and was recently appointed to Co-Chair the 2021 ASIL Annual Meeting. She received her JD from Thomas Jefferson School of Law, focused on international human rights law, and her LLM from AU Washington College of Law, with dual specializations in gender and international human rights.

*Session II:*

**Mr. Andrew Lane**, Director, Quaker Council for European Affairs

Andrew serves in Brussels as Director of the Quaker Council for European Affairs (QCEA), an organization focused on promoting peacebuilding and human rights. Prior to this role, Andrew worked in policing, as the principal policy advisor to a regional police commissioner in the UK.

**Ms. Quinn McKew**, Acting Executive Director, Article 19

Quinn McKew is the Executive Director of Article 19, previously leading ARTICLE 19 global programs on digital rights, protection of civic space, gender and transparency and accountability. Quinn is a leading international voice on the protection of civic space from a rights-based perspective. She is also a board member of The Equal Rights Trust – an international organization combating discrimination. Prior to joining ARTICLE 19, she worked for the largest non-profit management consultancy in Europe, and was a campaign manager for leading environmental organizations in the United States. Quinn has a Master's of Business Administration from Georgetown University and a BA in International Relations and the Environment from Stanford University.

**Mr. Tome Shekerdjiev**, Acting Deputy Head, Tolerance and Non-Discrimination Department, OSCE ODIHR (Moderator)

Tome Shekerdjiev is the Acting Deputy Head of the Tolerance and Non-Discrimination Department of the OSCE Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights addressing issues of racism, xenophobia, religious discrimination, and hate crimes. He has over 12 years of experience working in the OSCE on addressing intolerance, human rights, legislation reform, and capacity building. Before this, Mr. Shekerdjiev was working for civil society organizations providing free legal aid to victims of police brutality, designing legal training programs for civil servants from minority communities, as well as consulting on good governance projects. He holds a Master of Laws degree from the Comparative Constitutional Law Programme at the Central European University in Budapest, Hungary.

*Session III:*

**Ms. Montserrat Pina Martínez**, President, European Network of Policewomen

President of the European Network of Policewomen and member of the Equality Commission of Barcelona Council. She is Superintendent in the Barcelona City Police. She has a degree in Psychology, post-updated degree in Clinical Psychopathology, Executive Master's in Public Administration, Master's in Local Management and Administration, Master's in Criminology and Judicial Procedures, and Master's in Research in Security and Crime Prevention. She has been the Deputy Director of the Catalonia Police School and Human Rights and Police Deontology trainer, director of a male prison in Catalonia, and the Director of Crime Prevention Service in Barcelona Council.

**Ms. Savita Pawnday**, Deputy Executive Director, Global Centre for the Responsibility to Protect

Ms. Pawnday oversees Global Centre's programming in New York and Geneva, and leads on developing innovative institutional mechanisms and capacities needed to prevent mass atrocities both at national and international level. In 2010, Ms. Pawnday was instrumental in launching the Global Network of R2P Focal Points. With over 60 countries, the Global Network of R2P Focal Points is the largest network of senior government officials of its kind. Currently, Ms. Pawnday is involved in leading Global Centre engagement with UN Peacekeeping and in identifying strategies, including training, on how to enhance protection capacities of peacekeepers on the ground. Prior to joining the Global Centre for the Responsibility to Protect, Ms. Pawnday worked in various capacities as a researcher and a project manager. She has worked in Zimbabwe, Zambia and Malawi with Catholic Relief Services, in New York with Trickle Up and in India with a few grassroots NGOs. She holds an M.A. from Fordham University in political economy and development, with a specialization in political economy of civil wars, and a B.A. in Economics from St. Xavier's College, University of Mumbai.

**Mr. Christophe Kamp**, Director, HCNM (Moderator)

Christophe Kamp is the Director of the office of the OSCE High Commissioner on National Minorities. Christophe has nearly 20 years of experience as a diplomat of the Netherlands Foreign Ministry and the European External Action Service in Europe and Africa. Prior posts included Deputy Permanent Representative of the EU to the OSCE (2013-2017), Spokesperson for the Netherlands Foreign Minister and for the Minister for Development Cooperation and European Affairs (2011-2013) and Head of the Political Section of the EU Delegation to the African Union (2008-2011). Before joining the Netherlands Foreign Ministry in 2001, Christophe worked at the UN Department of Political Affairs in New York, and from 1996 to 1998 as a human rights observer with the UN Human Rights Field Operation in Rwanda. He also worked with Conflict Management Group, an NGO dedicated to negotiation and conflict resolution. Christophe has a Master in Political Science from Leiden University and a Master in Public Administration from the Harvard Kennedy School.

*Closing remarks:*

**Ms. Katarzyna Gardapkhadze**, First Deputy Director, OSCE ODIHR

Katarzyna Gardapkhadze is the First Deputy Director of ODIHR, where she oversees activities of the Election, Democratization, Human Rights, Tolerance and Non-Discrimination, and Roma and Sinti programmes. Prior to her current appointment in August 2016, she was the Head of ODIHR's Human Rights Department. Ms. Gardapkhadze is an expert in strategic planning and change management, conflict resolution and mediation, with a thematic expertise in human and children rights and gender equality. She has more than 20 years of professional experience from Poland, the United States, Western Balkans, the South Caucasus and Central Asia. In 2003–2011, Ms. Gardapkhadze led conflict resolution, human rights and child/social welfare reform programs in the South Caucasus, also advising similar programs in Central Asia. In 2000–2002, she managed initiatives focused on human rights, minorities and inter-ethnic dialogue in Western Balkans. Fluent in Polish, English and Russian, Ms. Gardapkhadze holds a Master's Degree in social sciences.

**Ms. Erida Dobrush**i, Minister Plenipotentiary, Deputy Permanent Representative, 2020 Albanian Chairmanship

Ms. Erida Dobrush*i* was appointed Minister Plenipotentiary and Deputy Permanent Representative of the Republic of Albania to the OSCE and other International Organizations in Vienna in November 2019. Since January 2020, she serves as Chairperson of the OSCE Preparatory Committee under the Albanian OSCE Chairmanship.

Prior to this assignment, Ms. Dobrush*i* has worked as senior expert in international programs, supporting good governance and democracy in Albania (April 2014-November 2019). She has extensive experience in elections management and has served as Director of Elections Infrastructure and Logistics of the Central Election Commission in Albania (December 2002 – April 2014). For several years, she has been part of civil society organizations and think tanks (1998-2002).

Ms. Dobrushki holds a BA degree in Social Sciences from the University of Tirana (1998), MSc in Politics and Administration from the University of Bologna (2002) and MA Degree in Administrative Law from the University of Tirana (2014).