OSCE Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights Election Observation Mission Bosnia and Herzegovina General Elections, 12 October 2014



INTERIM REPORT 3 - 22 September 2014

26 September 2014

I. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

- On 12 October 2014, the citizens of Bosnia and Herzegovina (BiH) will vote in six distinct contests under a complex institutional arrangement within a state separated into two entities: the Federation of BiH (FBiH) and Republika Srpska (RS). Ethnic divisions are determining factors in the country's political discourse.
- The legal framework continues to enshrine ethnicity-based restrictions on the right to stand as a candidate. The gender quota for candidate lists and composition of the election administration has been increased, addressing a previous OSCE/ODIHR recommendation. Several other recommendations remain unaddressed. The number of votes required for a candidate to be elected in each constituency deviates significantly, violating the principle of equality of the vote.
- Recent legal amendments transferred competencies for deciding on conflicts of interests for elected offices from the Central Election Commission (CEC) to a parliamentary commission, in a process that was questioned by a number of OSCE/ODIHR EOM interlocutors.
- The three-level election administration is headed by the CEC. While the CEC generally enjoys public confidence, a number of OSCE/ODIHR EOM interlocutors raised concerns that the election process, especially the vote count, may be open to abuse. In addition, although the Polling Station Commissions (PSC) were formed within the legal deadlines, the OSCE/ODIHR EOM has received numerous claims that electoral contestants are trading PSC positions to get representation in areas where they have specific interest.
- In total 3,278,908 voters are registered for these elections, including 42,044 who registered to vote from abroad by post and 214 in diplomatic representations. The CEC identified over 600 postal vote applications where it suspected fraud and referred them to the prosecutor for investigation. For the first time, voters in Brčko district will have to choose the citizenship of one of the two entities to be able to vote.
- Candidate registration was conducted by the CEC in a generally inclusive manner. For state and entity elections, 51 political parties, 517 candidate lists with 3,524 candidates, and 15 independent candidates were registered. For the BiH Presidency election, 17 candidates were registered, of which only one is a woman. For the election of the RS President and Vice-Presidents, 19 candidates were registered, of which two are women.
- The campaign officially started on 12 September and is visible throughout the country. The majority of electoral contestants focus their campaign programmes on issues of social protection and economic development. Despite previous OSCE/ODIHR recommendations, no new measures were introduced to increase the transparency of campaign finances or the auditing capacity of the CEC.
- The BiH media environment is diverse, yet largely segmented along ethnic lines. The reliance on

advertising revenue in an oversaturated market leaves media outlets vulnerable to political pressure and may limit their editorial independence. There are widespread allegations of political bias in the public broadcast media, as well as of the political affiliation of private and print media.

• To date 80 complaints have been submitted to the election administration. While there is an expedited time for review of election-related disputes, the legislation does not provide for a public hearing of such cases.

II. INTRODUCTION

Following an invitation from the Central Election Commission (CEC) of Bosnia and Herzegovina (BiH) and based on the recommendation of a Needs Assessment Mission conducted from 24 to 27 June, the OSCE/ODIHR has deployed an Election Observation Mission (EOM) on 3 September 2014. The EOM, headed by Cornelia Jonker, consists of 11 experts based in Sarajevo and 20 long-term observers deployed throughout the country. Mission members are drawn from 23 OSCE participating States. Participating States have been requested to second 300 short-term observers to observe voting, counting, and tabulation of results. On 12 October, elections will also be held for the ten Cantonal Assemblies in the Federation of BiH. The OSCE/ODIHR EOM will comment on those only to the extent that they impact the general elections.

III. BACKGROUND

The State of BiH is composed of two entities: the Federation of BiH (FBiH) and Republika Srpska (RS). In addition to the entities, Brčko district is an administrative unit under the supervision of the Office of the High Representative. With the complex legal framework resulting from the unique constitutional arrangements agreed in the 1995 General Framework Agreement for Peace (Dayton Agreement), some powers are granted to state-level institutions, while most are vested in entity-level institutions.

In February 2014, BiH witnessed large-scale socio-economic protests, triggered by high unemployment and allegations of corruption. In May, the socio-economic situation was further exacerbated by severe floods.

The country's division along ethnic lines is reflected in the electorate's vote. Political parties orient themselves towards their own ethnic communities: the Party for Democratic Action (SDA), the Party for BiH (SBiH), the Party for Better Future (SBB) among others count on the support of the Bosniaks; the Croatian Democratic Union of BiH (HDZ BiH), the Croatian Democratic Union – 1990 (HDZ-1990) and other ethnic-Croat parties compete for the Croat vote; and the political parties appealing to the Serb electorate include among others, the Alliance of Independent Social Democrats (SNSD), the Serb Democratic Party (SDS), the Party of Democratic Progress (PDP). There are a few political parties claiming to be multi-ethnic, among them the Social Democratic Party (SDP), and the Democratic Front (DF) founded in 2013 by the Croat member of the BiH Presidency Željko Komšić. With few exceptions no new political figures have emerged and are contesting for these elections.

Previous OSCE/ODIHR reports on BiH are available at: http://www.osce.org/odihr/elections/bih.

IV. THE LEGAL FRAMEWORK

Elections are primarily regulated by the Constitution and election law. These are supplemented by Annex III of the Dayton Agreement, the Law on Financing Political Parties, the Law on Citizenship, the Law on Conflict of Interest, as well as regulations issued by the CEC. In addition, there are different relevant laws in the two Entities.²

Since its adoption in 2001, the election law was most recently amended in 2014. The recent amendments met some prior OSCE/ODIHR recommendations including increasing the gender participation quota to 40 per cent both in election administration and in candidate lists. However, a number of shortcomings remain unaddressed, including ensuring effective legal redress, failure to adopt a law on political parties, insufficient campaign finance regulations as well as provisions to prevent the possible misuse of state resources.

The legal framework continues to pose ethnicity-based restrictions on the right to stand as a candidate and to vote. The right to stand for the BiH Presidency is granted only to citizens who declare themselves as Bosniaks, Croats or Serbs.³ In addition the right to stand as a candidate is limited by residency: a Serb registered in the FBiH and a Bosniak or Croat in the RS cannot stand for the BiH Presidency. The European Union strongly criticized the lack of "a credible effort in implementing the European Court of Human Rights judgment in the *Sejdic-Finci* case regarding discrimination against citizens on the grounds of ethnicity." Voting rights are also limited by residence: RS voters can only vote for a Serb candidate for the BiH presidency, while voters in the FBiH may only vote for either a Bosniak or Croat candidate. The OSCE/ODIHR has previously recommended that the law be amended to remove both limitations.

Following recent amendments to the Law on Conflict of Interest, the mandate for deciding on conflicts of interests for elected offices was transferred from the CEC to a newly established parliamentary commission. Several OSCE/ODIHR EOM interlocutors raised serious concerns about the inclusivity of the amendment process, as well as the lack of harmonization of the relevant legislation and the parliamentary commission's ability to fulfill its duties in a timely and impartial manner.

V. ELECTORAL SYSTEM

Under the complex institutional and electoral system, six separate contests will take place in these elections. At the state level, all citizens will vote for the BiH Presidency and BiH House of

Namely the Constitutions of FBiH and RS, the RS Law on Financing of Political Parties, the RS Law on Political Parties, the Brčko Law on Financing of Political Parties and the Brčko Law on Political Organizations. FBiH does not have a law on political parties, or a law on financing of political parties.

The Constitution recognizes Bosniaks, Croats and Serbs as 'constituent peoples,' on the basis of self-declaration. Citizens that choose not to affiliate with any ethnic group can declare themselves as 'others.'

The European Union Progress Report on Bosnia and Herzegovina, 16 October 2013, available at: http://ec.europa.eu/enlargement/pdf/key_documents/2013/package/brochures/bosnia_and_herzegovina_2013.pdf. On 22 December 2009, the European Court of Human Rights issued a decision stating that ethnicity-based ineligibility to stand as a candidate is "...incompatible with the general principles of the European Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms," See Sejdić and Finci v. Bosnia and Herzegovina (ECtHR 2009).

The Law on Conflict of Interest was amended on 19 November 2013. The commission was established on 15 April 2014, and consists of nine members: Six are members of the BiH parliament and three are from the Agency for Prevention of Corruption and Coordination in the Fight Against Corruption. The Law on Conflict of Interest and the Law on Council of Ministers contain conflicting provisions, which need to be harmonized.

Representatives (BiH HoR). In addition, citizens registered in FBiH will vote for the FBiH House of Representatives (FBiH HoR) and those registered in the RS will vote for the RS President and Vice Presidents and the RS National Assembly (RS NA).

The three members of the BiH Presidency are elected by simple majority on separate lists in the two entities. The RS Presidency is also elected by simple majority. The candidate who received most votes is elected president, while the top two candidates from the two constituent peoples other than the candidate elected as RS President are elected as vice-presidents.

Members of the BiH HoR and FBiH HoR as well as the RS NA are elected by preferential vote in multi-member constituencies (MMCs). For all three, compensatory mandates are allocated from closed party lists after the initial allocation of mandates, to compensate for inadequate proportional representation of the party, coalition or candidate list. For the FBiH HoR and the RS NA, the election law guarantees minimum representation, four seats for each of the three constituent peoples.

The number of votes required for a candidate to be elected in each MMC deviates significantly, violating the principle of equality of the vote. This is applicable for the elections of HoRs, both in BiH and the FBiH, and the RS NA, despite the recent review of MMC boundaries for the latter.

VI. THE ELECTION ADMINISTRATION

Elections are administered by the CEC and 142 Municipal Election Commissions (MECs). The election-day voting and counting processes are conducted by some 5,546 Polling Station Commissions (PSCs), including 5 PSCs established at diplomatic representations abroad.

The CEC has overall responsibility for the elections. This includes passing detailed regulations on election procedures, printing ballot papers, and approving and publishing election results. Its seven members are appointed by the parliament for a seven-year term, minding the ethnic composition of the country. The CEC experienced some delays in selection of the company for printing ballot papers, however, it reported that all ballots are produced and will be distributed on time. In general, the CEC enjoys confidence among electoral stakeholders. It holds regular sessions, which are open to accredited observers and media.

MECs are responsible for establishing PSCs and overseeing voting and counting procedures. They are appointed by municipal authorities for seven-year terms minding the ethnic composition of the municipality, according to the last census and generally have experience in election administration. While most MECs conduct their work in public sessions, the OSCE/ODIHR EOM noted that some also held informal, unannounced meetings, which reduced the transparency of their work.

All 5,546 PSCs have been established within the legal deadline. PSCs are appointed by the respective MECs based on nominations from electoral contestants and have three or five members, depending on the precinct size. In principle, each electoral contestant can appoint an equal number of PSC members, randomly assigned through a lottery organized by the CEC, after which the

This includes six City Election Commissions and the Election Commission of Brčko District.

It has two Bosniaks, two Croats, two Serbs and one other, based on self-declaration.

In June, the Public Procurement Review Board (PPRB) cancelled the CEC decision to award the printing of ballots to the company *Zrinski d.d.* from Croatia, chosen through a bidding process. The CEC decided to award the contract to the second ranked bidder *Atlantik BB* from Banja Luka. *Zrinski* filed a complaint to the CEC, and further to the PPRB. The latter said they would not hear the appeal due to lack of quorum. On 17 July, CEC decided to proceed with *Atlantik* in order to not jeopardize the timely printing of ballots.

contestants submit nominations to the MECs. While it appears that the appointment of PSCs was formally carried out according to the law, there were numerous claims by MECs, political parties and citizen observers that electoral contestants engaged in the trading of PSC positions to get representation in areas where they have specific interest. A number of MECs also expressed concerns that some PSCs may lack the knowledge and experience to conduct elections according to procedures. A number of OSCE/ODIHR EOM interlocutors further worried that the process, especially the vote count, may be open to abuse.

VII. VOTER REGISTRATION

Voter registration is passive and based on the population register. Citizens who are over 18 are eligible to vote, unless disenfranchised by a final court decision for reasons of legal incapacity or part of a criminal conviction. ¹⁰ There are 3,278,908 eligible voters for these elections.

The CEC has an overall responsibility for maintaining the Central Voter Register (CVR). OSCE/ODIHR EOM interlocutors generally expressed confidence in the accuracy of the voter register. Voters could check their registration status online, by phone, or by going to the MECs and request corrections, until the closure of the CVR on 28 August. Voters temporarily residing abroad could apply until 29 July to the CEC in order to vote abroad by post or in diplomatic representations. In addition, the CEC adds to the CVR information about internally displaced persons (IDPs) who have the right to choose to vote either according to their temporary residence or their residence before being displaced. Voters who have a valid identification card, proving their residence, and who are not on the voter list on election day, and voters who register to vote abroad but come to BiH on election day can vote by provisional ballots.

Some 42,044 voters were registered to vote by post from abroad, while 5,096 applications were denied by the CEC due to various mistakes, including lack of proof of identity or signature. The CEC identified possible abuses, including applications for 37 dead persons and 608 cases in which impersonation or false application was suspected. The CEC also received allegations of four different cases in which voters abroad received packages with ballot papers for more than one voter. The CEC has sent information about these cases to the prosecutor for investigation.

For the first time, voters in Brčko district will have to choose an entity citizenship to be able to vote. While Brčko authorities have been running an active information campaign since January, only 45,317 Brčko residents chose entity citizenship by the 28 August deadline, leaving 39,974 residents without entity citizenship. In case these citizens obtain entity citizenship by election day, they will be able to vote with a provisional ballot.

If a contestant failed to submit nominations, the PSC positions were filled directly by the MECs.

This includes those who are sentenced or indicted by the International Criminal Tribunal for the former Yugoslavia or a court in BiH for serious violations of humanitarian law.

Due to the small number of applications, voting in person will only be possible for 214 voters in five embassies or consular departments in Austria and Germany. Other voters abroad will have to vote by post.

By the 29 July deadline some 20,709 internally displaced persons chose to vote according to their residence before being displaced, i.e. according to the 1991 census.

Provisional ballots are cast in specially assigned polling stations and counted in the Main Counting Centre in Sarajevo after information on the voter and his/her eligibility to vote is checked against the CVR.

VIII. REGISTRATION OF CANDIDATES

Candidates can be nominated by political parties, coalitions, or stand as independent. To register candidates for the elections, political parties and prospective independent candidates must submit an application for certification to the CEC supported by a registration deposit. Regardless of the high number of candidates registered for these elections, some OSCE/ODIHR EOM interlocutors suggested that the deposits, which were increased by up to 40 per cent for these elections, are too high, especially for independent candidates. ¹⁴ In addition to the deposit, electoral contestants who were not represented in the outgoing elected body, which they registered for, were required to collect signatures. ¹⁵ The collection of signatures for the BiH Presidency, however, is obligatory for all electoral contestants.

In order for political parties and candidates to participate in the elections, the CEC has to certify their eligibility before registration. The candidate certification and registration process started on 16 May and concluded on 20 August in a process that generally appeared to be inclusive. The CEC certified a total 51 political parties and 15 independent candidates. Four parties were denied certification due to lack of signatures and of the registration deposit, and one withdrew. After the certification process political parties formed 14 coalitions and 517 candidate lists with 3,524 candidates were registered for state and entity elections. For the BiH Presidency election, the CEC registered 17 candidates, of which only one is a woman. For the election of the RS President and Vice-Presidents, 19 candidates were registered, of which two are women.

IX. CAMPAIGN ENVIRONMENT

The campaign officially started on 12 September and ends 24 hours before election day. The OSCE/ODIHR EOM was made aware of a number of incidents of campaigning prior to the official start of the campaign.

Since the beginning of the official campaign, most contestants have been campaigning intensively. Main campaign messages have been conveyed through billboards, leaflets, rallies and advertisement in the media. The majority of electoral contestants have developed campaign programmes focusing on the issues of social protection and economic development. They also call for change, economic reform and fighting corruption. Numerous OSCE/ODIHR EOM interlocutors raised concern over the expected use of nationalist rhetoric and inflammatory speech in the campaign, but none has so far been observed by the OSCE/ODIHR EOM in the campaign rallies attended.

The OSCE/ODIHR EOM observed campaign rallies in Sarajevo, Mostar, Tuzla, Brčko, Travnik, Foča, and Bosanska Krupa organized by SDA, SBB, SDP, DF, HDZ BiH, People's Party Working for Well-Being, the coalition Serb-Democratic Party-Party of United Pensioners-Serb Radical Party RS, and the coalition Democratic People's Union-Nova Srpska-Serb Radical Party (Future of Srpska). The campaign atmosphere is generally calm and so far no incidents have been reported. According to OSCE/ODIHR EOM estimates, the average participation in campaign rallies ranges from 300 to 600, among them 30-50 per cent women.

The registration deposits were BAM 20,000 for the BiH Presidency and BiH HoR and BAM 14,000 for entity-level elections for political parties (BAM 1.95583 equals EUR 1). The amount is halved for independent candidates. The deposit is returned to the applicant in case they are elected or in case the registration is denied by the CEC

Political parties needed to collect 3,000 signatures for the BiH Presidency and BiH HoR, and 2,000 for entity elections. Independent candidates need to collect half the number of signatures.

One MEC took action against two parties for violating the campaign regulations, ¹⁶ and two prominent candidates were arrested on non-election related charges. ¹⁷

X. CAMPAIGN FINANCE

Campaign finance is regulated by the Law on Financing Political Parties, as well as CEC regulations. ¹⁸ Electoral contestants can finance their campaigns by receiving funding from entity budgets, from membership fees and donations by individuals and legal entities. ¹⁹ For each electoral contest an electoral contestant may spend up to BAM 0.30 per registered voter. There is no obligation to submit interim reports on campaign donations and expenditures. The CEC Audit Department, which oversees campaign financing, receives two financial reports from each electoral contestant: one at the time of registration for the period of the past three months and the second within 30 days after the official announcement of the election results for the period following registration. However, there are no deadlines for auditing or publishing these reports. ²⁰ Additionally, all candidates must submit property statements within 15 days of their registration as a candidate. On grounds of personal data protection, the CEC is no longer publishing the property statements of the candidates. ²¹

XI. THE MEDIA

The BiH media environment is diverse but largely segmented along ethnic lines. The Public Broadcasting System (PBS) consists of one state-wide broadcaster, and two channels operating at entity level. In addition, there are over 40 television (TV) and 140 radio stations functioning on national or local level. TV is the primary source of information along with the Internet, which is becoming increasingly accessible countrywide.²²

The election law and CEC regulations provide a comprehensive legal framework for media coverage of the election campaign. It provides for both free (in public media) and paid airtime on equal terms to all contestants. The broadcast media are required to respect the principles of balance, fairness, and impartiality, especially in their information programmes. The Communications Regulatory Agency

The CEC received two appeals of decisions by MEC Rogatica to order *Stranka Napredna Srpska* and the Coalition DNS-NS-SRS to remove their campaign posters. The two cases are still pending with the CEC.

The Council of Europe's Group of States against Corruption (GRECO), in its 2013 compliance report noted that the majority of its recommendations have yet to be addressed, including those related to the transparency of donations and the identity of donors, the monitoring capacity of the CEC, and the range of available sanctions. See: http://www.coe.int/t/dghl/monitoring/greco/evaluations/round3/GrecoRC3(2013)16 Bosnia-

Herzegovina EN.pdf.

Individuals may donate up to BAM 10,000 and legal entities up to BAM 50,000. Foreign contributions, as well as funding from administrative bodies, public institutions, and anonymous donations are prohibited.

The OSCE/ODIHR EOM was informed that following the 2010 general elections, it took almost two years for the results of the CEC audits to be published.

Agency for Personal Data Protection (Decision No 03-1-37-19-369-1/11 from 2 August 2011) and Appellate Council of the Court of BiH (Decision Ni S1 3 U 007099 12 Uvp from 4 April 2012) advised against publishing the scanned property statements, which contain personal data, on the website.

According to the 2014 Global Internet Report, 67.9 per cent of the BiH population is using the Internet. See: http://www.internetsociety.org/sites/default/files/Global_Internet_Report_2014_0.pdf.

On 10 September, Mladen Ivanković Lijanović, the president of the People's Party for Well-Being and candidate for the BiH HoR was arrested along with Jerko Ivanković Lijanović, the party's vice-president, deputy prime minister of FBiH and minister of agriculture, running for FBiH HoR and nine others for allegation of tax evasion. On 11 September, the party's president was released pending trial. At a meeting with the OSCE/ODIHR EOM he stated that the above-mentioned arrests had negatively affected the party's campaign.

(CRA) is responsible for the regulation of broadcasters, and adjudicates election-related complaints and imposes sanctions in case of misconduct. The CRA does not conduct its own systematic monitoring of the media but rather acts upon complaints received. Despite previous OSCE/ODIHR recommendations, there are no deadlines for the review of complaints. So far the CRA has registered and is investigating one complaint from a political party against the public broadcaster. The BiH Press Council, a self-regulatory body for the print media, handles complaints related to print media coverage, but it has no legal powers or enforcement mechanisms.

Numerous OSCE/ODIHR EOM interlocutors raised concerns over biased coverage of the election campaign in public as well as private media linked to the influence of political elites over their editorial policies. In addition, the reliance on advertising revenue in an oversaturated market leaves media outlets vulnerable to political pressure and may limit their editorial independence.

The OSCE/ODIHR EOM on 1 September commenced qualitative and quantitative media monitoring of the prime-time broadcasts of seven TV channels and the content of five newspapers. ²³

XII. COMPLAINTS AND APPEALS

Election-related complaints can only be filed by a voter or an electoral contestant, provided that their rights are directly violated. The CEC serves as a first instance for reviewing most election-related complaints and as a second instance for appeals on decisions of MECs. All CEC decisions can be subject to judicial review before the Appellate Division of the Court of BiH as the final instance. Complaints must be filed within 24 hours from the violation and appeals within 48 hours from the first instance decision. Complaints are adjudicated within 48 hours by election commissions and within three days by the court. The legislation does not ensure a public hearing but the parties to the complaint can submit written statements in support of the case. A case may be further referred to the prosecutor if it entails elements of a criminal act. A number of cases are still pending with the prosecutor from the 2010 elections.

The CEC has introduced a comprehensive internal log of complaints; however, its public access is limited. The OSCE/ODIHR EOM has been made aware of some 80 complaints and appeals lodged with the CEC and MECs. Of them, 25 complaints were filed on appointments of PSCs and 9 on appointments of MECs, 17 on political party and candidate registration, 8 on pre-term campaigning and 10 on voting by mail. The majority were rejected. In some cases, the CEC dismissed complaints on procedural grounds, finding that a complainant's rights were not directly violated. The Appellate Division of the BiH Court rejected all appeals of CEC decisions. ²⁵

XIII. CITIZEN AND INTERNATIONAL OBSERVERS

The legislation provides for observation of the election process by accredited observers, including electoral contestants, citizen non-partisan observers and international observers. Seven organizations

The OSCE/ODIHR EOM is monitoring the election and campaign coverage of primetime broadcasts of three public TV channels: BHT1, FTV and TV RTRS; and four private channels: OBN, TV Hayat, TV1 and BN. In addition, news programs of TV Pink BH and FACE TV are also being monitored as well as are the contents of newspapers *Dnevni Avaz*, *Dnevni List*, *Glas Srpske*, *Oslobodjenje* and Press RS.

The CEC dismissed two complaints on procedural grounds without review: one from SNSD against PDP on early campaigning and a second about the false identity of a candidate. Subsequently, CEC reviewed the issues *ex officio* and imposed a fine in both cases.

No further information on the appeals to the Court of BiH is available because the court has to date not yet agreed to a meeting with the OSCE/ODIHR EOM.

formed the coalition, *Pod Lupom* to observe the election campaign, the work of election commissions and election day proceedings. ²⁶ In July, the coalition deployed 42 LTOs and plans to have some 3,000 observers to follow polling and counting in 1,400 polling stations.

XIV. OSCE/ODIHR EOM ACTIVITIES

The OSCE/ODIHR EOM commenced its work on 3 September. The Head of the Mission met with the Ministry of Foreign Affairs, the CEC and other high-level state officials, representatives of the international community and diplomatic representatives. The EOM has also established contacts with political parties and candidates, representatives of the media, civil society and other electoral stakeholders.

The OSCE Parliamentary Assembly (OSCE PA) and the Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe (PACE) have announced that they will deploy observer delegations for election-day observation. The OSCE Chairperson-in-Office has appointed Roberto Battelli as Special Coordinator to lead the short-term OSCE observer mission for these elections.

Centre For Civic Initiatives, Youth Information Agency, Infohouse, Centre for Citizen Cooperation, *Perpetuum Mobile Banja Luka, DON Prijedor* and Forum of Tuzla Citizens.